



## Shooting to Kill: The Ethics of Police and Military Use of Lethal Force

Seumas Miller

Print publication date: 2016

Print ISBN-13: 9780190626136

Published to Oxford Scholarship Online: November 2016

DOI: 10.1093/acprof:oso/9780190626136.001.0001

## (p.287) Index

- Abdallah, Gary, 116
- absolute rights, 113
- ACPO (Association of Chief Police Officers), 151–152
- Afghan Intelligence Network, 240
- Afghanistan, 1, 244, 248–251, 253, 271
- agency, 58
- Ahmedabad, Gujarat, India, 120
- Alexander II, 241
- Alexandra, Andrew, 80n6, 109n1
- al-Qaeda, 1, 102, 163, 248–250, 253, 263
- al-Shabab, 163
- Amanullah, Zabet, 240
- Amin, Muhammad, 240
- Amnesty International, 234
- ANC (African National Congress), 161
- Arkin, Ronald, 278n7, 280n13, 281n14
- armed conflict, 159, 164–165
- armed force. *See* military
- armed suspects, 137
- assassination, 12–13, 237, 239–248
- atomism, 81
- Australian Defence Force, 87
- autonomous weapons, 271–283. *See also* “human-in-the-loop” weapons; “human-on-the-loop” weapons; “human-out-of-the-loop” weapons
  - defined, 13–14
  - human responsibility and, 13–14
  - “killer robots,” 279
  - moral responsibility and, 276–283
  - Samsung stationary robot, 271
- Avon, Dermot, 116
- basic rights, 17, 24, 219, 226, 228

- violations of, 231–234
- Bittner, Egon, 78n2
- bin Laden, Osama, 13, 237, 242–243, 252, 255, 258–264
- BKN (Baby Killer Nation), 198–199
- Blackler, John, 8n19, 63n29, 79n3, 109n1, 110n2, 120n17, 245n15
- blameworthiness, 15–16
- Boko Haram, 163
- Borgia, Cesare, 241
- Bosnia, 1, 12, 212–213, 220
- Bratman, Michael, 28n16, 28n18
- Brown, Michael, 1, 119, 130
- Bryant, Martin, 124
- Bush, George H. W., 242
- Bush, George W., 242
- causal responsibility, 91–92, 279
- cause corruption, 245
- CET (collective end theory, Miller), 28–30, 34, 38, 83. *See also* collective ends; joint action
  - (p.288)** chain of institutional and moral responsibility, 154–155
- Chee Ming Tsen, 124
- civilian immunity, 11–12
  - culpable omissions and, 206–210
  - principle of discrimination and, 185–211
  - rights violations and, 200–206
- civilians. *See also* civilian immunity
  - categories of, 186
  - killing innocent, 192–197
  - prioritizing, 187
- Clausewitz, Carl von, 250n25
- Coady, C. A. J., 9n24, 45n3, 162n7
- collateral damage, 241, 268
- collective ends, 153–154, 204, 275. *See also* CET (collective end theory, Miller)
  - morally significant, 222–223
  - nested, 179–180
  - properties of, 85
  - proximate, 180–181
- collective responsibility, 150–151
  - for omissions, 209–210
  - partialist, 85
- combatants
  - versus civilians, 11, 187–192
  - “moral equality” of. *See* Moral Equality of Combatants (Walzer)
- consequentialism, 2
  - “constructive engagement,” 235
- Convention for the Prevention and Punishment of Terrorism, 242
- Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of Crimes against Internationally Protected Persons, including Diplomatic Agents, 242
- conventions, 30, 169, 171
- counterterrorism, 8, 264–270

- Croatia, 224–225
- culpable omissions, 206–210
  - conditions for, 232–233
- culture, 82
- cyberwarfare, 88
- David, Steven, 242–243
- defense of others, 21, 44–45, 106, 108–109, 182. *See also* self-defense
  - citizens and, 117
  - police and, 117–122, 137
- Dick, Cressida, 140, 143–145, 155–156
- “dirty hands,” 245–246
- discrimination, principle of, 11, 18–19, 102, 185–211, 258, 263, 272–276, 279–283
- Dresden, Germany, 247, 250
- drones, 1–2, 13–14, 167, 251, 253, 255, 264–271
- Dunlap, Charles, 243
- Dworkin, Ronald, 16
- East Timor, 1, 12, 212–213
- enslavement, 216
- Escobar, Pablo, 246–247
- ethnic cleansing, 203–205, 215–216, 220, 225, 236
- extrajudicial killing, 237, 239, 257. *See also* targeted killing
- Fabre, Cecile, 3, 7
- FATA (Federally Administered Tribal Areas), 13, 253, 255, 264–269
- Ferguson, Missouri, 2, 119, 130
- FIST (fault-based internalist (suspendable) rights-based theory), 5–6, 284–285. *See also* suspended rights
  - background intuitions of, 73
  - objections to, 74–77
  - self-defense and, 69–77
- forced choice, 49–55
- Ford, Gerald, 242
- foreseen consequences, and intentions, 197–199
- forfeited rights, 49
- French, Peter, 81
- Frowe, Helen, 3, 7
- function, 82
- (p.289)** Gaddafi, Muammar, 238, 242, 244, 246–247
- Gates, Robert, 238
- genocide, 216, 219–220, 225–226, 231
- Gilbert, Margaret, 81
- Gordon, Ian, 8n22, 87n22, 93n30, 138n1, 149n7, 256n44
- Griffin, James, 2n3, 16n4
- Gross, Michael, L., 12n30, 252n34
- Habyarimana, Juvénal, 219
- Hallenstein, Hal, 124
- Haydar, Bashshar, 188–189
- Hitler, Adolf, 243
- Hobbes, Thomas, 110n3
- “human-in-the-loop” weapons, 277, 279–280, 283

- humanitarian intervention, armed, 12, 212–236
  - justifications for, 212–218, 229–230
  - preventative, 216
- “human-on-the-loop” weapons, 277–280, 283
- “human-out-of-the-loop” weapons, 1, 277–280, 283
- human rights
  - absolute rights and, 113
  - collective moral responsibility for violations of, 218–226
  - defined, 16–17
  - inalienable, 112–113
  - lethal force and, 16
  - natural, 112
  - violations, 215–218
  - violations, and organizations, 222
- Hussein, Saddam, 1, 207, 215–216, 242
- ICRC (International Committee of the Red Cross), 230
- immanence, principle of, 11, 18, 109, 114, 160, 254, 265–266
- impartiality, principle of, 65, 69. *See also* partialism
- individualism, 81–82
  - joint action and, 28–29
  - relational, 29
- individual rights, 64
- institutional ascent, 81
- institutional responsibility, 90–92, 151
  - joint responsibility and, 222
  - moral responsibility and, 221–224
- institutional rights, 22, 64
  - defined, 16–17
  - versus moral rights, 193–194
- institutional roles, 80, 82–90
  - dimensions of, 82
  - joint action and, 83–84
  - military and, 99–106
  - moral responsibility and, 85
  - normative teleological account of, 78–107
  - police and, 92–99
  - police versus military, 102–104
  - teleological normative theory of, 82–83
- intelligence-gathering/sharing, 79
- intentions, 60
  - foreseen consequences and, 197–199
  - individualism and, 32
  - second-order, 199
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 242
- Iraq, 1, 12, 212–214, 235, 250
- irregular soldiers. *See* mercenaries
- ISIS (Islamic State of Iraq and Syria), 4, 12, 102, 163–164, 177, 212–214, 218, 221, 250
- Israeli-Hezbollah conflict, 249
- JAB (*jus ad bellum*), 101, 160, 168–178

- domestic, 102
- ROE and, 178–184
- Jensen, Graeme, 132–133
- JIB (*jus in bello*), 102, 160, 273
  - principles of, 178, 281–283
  - robots and, 272
- (p.290)**
  - ROE and, 178–183
  - standard conditions of, 168
  - targeted killing and, 256, 266
- joint action, 4, 172, 283
  - collective responsibility and, 222, 225
  - defined, 19, 28
  - individual responsibility and, 150
  - institutional roles and, 83–84
  - layered structure of, 219–220, 224–225, 231–232
  - lethal force and, 28–30
  - multilayered structure of, 209–210, 273–274
  - negative rights violations and, 30–38
  - organizational action and, 4, 10
  - positive rights violations and, 38–42
  - scenarios of, 19–20
- justifiably infringed rights, 76
- JWT (just war theory), 160–168
- Kamm, Frances, 197–199
- Kapetanovski, John, 129
- Kasher, Asa, 186–190
- Keane, Fergal, 213
- Kennedy, John F., 240–241, 253
- Kleinig, John, 8
- Kosovo, 12, 212, 217, 223–224
- Kratos operation, 140–142, 149, 151–152
- Kutz, Christopher, 3, 8
- law, 169, 171
  - enforcement of, 121–137
- lawful orders, 147, 173–174
- lethal force, 106–107
  - citizens and, 136
  - coercive, 78–79
  - institutional, 2–3, 18
  - military use of. *See* military
  - moral justification for, 2
  - morally permissive, 15–43
  - noninstitutional, 3–4, 18, 160
  - police use of. *See* police
  - protection of human life and, 15
  - role-specificity and, 2
- “level-one” and “level two” actions, 84
- Libya, 212

- Locke, John, 70n37
- Lockwood, Clifton, 116
- Mabhoud, Mahmoud al-, 252
- MacDonald, Rod, 129
- May, Larry, 150n8, 185n1
- Marinoff, Paul, 129, 133
- Martin, David, 132-133, 146
- McMahan, Jeff, 3, 7, 10, 49, 64-69, 71, 73, 81, 286
- Medecins Sans Frontieres, 230
- Menezes, Jean Charles de, 1, 139-142, 144-145, 149-150, 154-157, 256
- mercenaries, 79, 159, 201
- military, 159. *See also* armed force
  - conditions for use of lethal force by, 104
  - institutional role of, 79, 99-106, 158, 166
  - lethal force and, 158-183
  - normative institutional analysis and, 78-106
  - peacekeeping operations and, 103-104
  - police use of, 2
  - proximate purpose of lethal force, by, 106
  - ultimate moral justification for use of lethal force by, 106
  - use of lethal forces, versus police use of, 10-11
- Militano, Mark, 115-116
- Montague, Philip, 5, 49, 73
- Moral Equality of Combatants (Walzer), 10, 169-178, 184, 286
- moral excusability, 26
- (p.291)** moral intuitions, 41
- morality, 169
- moral justification, 281
- moral legitimacy, 193-194
- moral obligations
  - collective, 86, 228
  - conditions for, 227
- moral partialism, 192-193
- moral permissibility, 15, 42
- moral ramification argument, 14, 272, 276
- moral responsibility, 34-35, 90-92, 142-145
  - blameworthiness and, 15-16
  - collective, 3, 150-156, 170-171, 215, 218-219, 231
  - collective, and intervention, 226-236
  - direct, 3
  - distributing, 154-156
  - full, 91
  - fully legal, 91
  - human rights violations and, 218-226
  - indirect, 3
  - individual, 3, 150, 170-171
  - individual, *tout court* versus jointly held, 43
  - institutional roles and, 85
  - intervention and, 215

- moral permissibility and, 15
- need-based, 207, 229
- partial, 91
- moral rights, 17, 24, 108
  - inalienable natural, 148
  - versus institutional rights, 193-194
  - joint action and, 39-40, 43, 85
  - justifiable enforceability and, 108-109
  - natural discretionary, 148
  - negative, 22
  - objective, 111
  - prima facie*, 175-176
  - pro tanto*, 175, 199
  - special, 85-86
  - specialized rights, 175-176
- MRND (National Revolutionary Movement for Development), 219
- Nathanson, Stephen, 7n15, 248n19
- NATO (North Atlantic Treaty Organization), 217, 223-225, 238
- natural responsibility, 142, 150
- natural rights, 17-18, 112-113, 173-176, 226-227, 229
  - aggregate, 285
  - FIST and, 75
- Nazi regime, 221
- necessity, principle of, 11, 18, 33, 36-37, 41, 43, 109, 160, 261, 269, 272-276, 281-283
  - JIB and, 178-184
  - military, 102
  - police and, 114
- negative rights, 4, 16, 19, 202, 229. *See also* joint action
  - defined, 17
  - human rights violations and, 216
  - lethal force and, 20-24
  - third party and, 207
  - third party obligations to enforce, 27
- nonreductionist collectivism, 3, 8
- nontransferable rights, 112
- Obama, Barack, 242, 267
- offenders
  - armed, 134-135
  - dangerous, 127
  - fleeing felon, 127-128, 130-132, 137
- original authority, doctrine of, 146-147
- Osman, Hussain, 140, 143, 149, 155
- Oswald, Lee Harvey, 240
- overridden rights, 71-72, 76. *See also* right to life
  - (p.292)** Pakistan, 1, 13, 244, 251, 258-260, 264-267, 271
- partialism, 68
- Pattison, James, 12n28, 212n2, 214n8
- peacekeeping operations, 103-104
- PMFs (private military forces), 80, 89

- police, 108-137
  - armed suspects and, 137
  - collective violence and, 119-121
  - conditions for use of lethal force by, 104-105
  - defense of others and, 137
  - deterrence in states of emergency and, 137
  - institutional independence and, 95-97
  - institutional moral rights and, 109
  - institutional role of, 92-99, 110-114
  - law enforcement and, 137
  - lethal force defense of others and, 117-122
  - lethal force self-defense and, 114-116
  - lethal force suicide-bombers and, 138-157
  - militarization of, 2, 120-121
  - monopoly of coercive force and, 97-98
  - normative institutional analysis and, 78-106
  - operational autonomy and, 95
  - preemptive (proactive) public order and, 119
  - quasi-judicial role of, 94
  - reactive public order and, 119
  - role of, 79, 108, 120
  - self-defense and, 136-137
  - states, 96
  - use of lethal forces, versus military use of, 104-106
- positive rights, 4, 16, 19, 64, 202, 229. *See also* joint action
  - defined, 17
  - human rights violations and, 216
  - lethal force and, 24-28
  - persons of diminished responsibility and, 207-208
  - third party obligations to enforce, 27
- Primoratz, Igor, 4n6, 169n14, 185n1, 210n31, 247n18, 250n26
- property rights, 22-23, 117-118, 121-136
- proportionality, principle of, 11, 18, 33, 37-38, 40, 42, 65, 69, 102, 109, 160, 261, 269, 272-276, 281-283
  - JAB and, 178-179, 181-182
  - JIB and, 178-179
  - police and, 114-115
- R2P (Responsibility to Protect), 214, 228, 232, 234
- Recommendation 85.1(Australian National Committee on Violence), 113
- reductionism, 3
- Reiman, Jeffrey, 8
- relationalism, 29
- revisionism, 3, 7-8, 10, 286
- rights violations
  - categories of people responsible for, 201
  - civilian immunity and, 200-206
  - life-threatening versus non-life-threatening, 202-206
- right to life, 45-49
  - forfeitable, 45-47



- overridable, 47–49, 64
- permutations to, 45–47
- robots. *See* autonomous weapons
- Rodin, David, 6
- ROE (rules of engagement), 161, 282
  - JIB and, 178–184
- Rwandan genocide, 1, 12, 100, 212–214, 219–220, 225–226, 228–230, 234, 236
- Ryan, Cheyney, 44n2, 45n5, 72n39, 73n40
- (p.293)** Sader, Gerhard Alfred, 124
- Said, Hussein, 129–130
- Schauer, Frederick, 91
- Schmitt, Frederick, 28
- Scott, Walter, 1, 130
- Searle, John, 19n8, 28n16, 82n13
- security, 93–94
  - collective external, 158
  - collective internal, 93–94, 97
- security agencies, 87–89
- security rights, 24
- self-defense, 44–77, 106, 108–109, 171, 283. *See also* defense of others
  - armed forces, 165
  - collective, 165, 263, 272, 274
  - FIST approach to. *See* FIST (fault-based internalist (suspendable) rights-based theory)
  - forced choice and. *See* forced choice
  - Hobbesian rights-based approach to, 55–57
  - individual, 15, 182
  - justifications for, 48
  - lethal force conditions for, 21
  - military, 182
  - morally permissive, 4–5, 21, 23
  - national, 165
  - no-fault rights-based approach to, 57–66
  - personal, 2–3
  - police and, 114–116, 136–137
  - responsibility approach to, 64–69
  - standard situation for, 44–45, 47, 52–54
  - unit, 165
- selfhood, 22–24
  - rights, 202, 226–227
- separation of powers, 96
- Sherwell, William, 130–131
- Shue, Henry, 17, 24, 226–227
- Sierra Leone, 212
- signature strikes, 267
- SIS (Special Investigation Section, Los Angeles Police Department), 135–136
- social norms, 30n20
- Somalia, 12, 212
- South Africa, 94, 221, 229

- Sparrow, Rob, 13n33, 279n10
- specialized rights, 86
- Stalin, Joseph, 243
- states of emergency, 137, 247
- Stauffenberg, Claus Schenk Graf von, 243
- Steinhoff, Uwe, 62n28, 77n41, 279n10
- Strawster, B. J., 266
- structure, 82
- subsistence rights, 24, 229
- suicide bombers, 8-9, 138-157
- supraindividualism, 28-29
- surgical strikes, 253, 266-270
- suspended rights, 49, 72-73, 76. *See also* FIST (fault-based internalist (suspendable) rights-based theory)
  - properties of, 70-71
- Syria, 1, 12, 213, 217, 230, 250
- Taliban, 1, 240, 253, 258
- targeted killing, 12-14, 237-269
  - collateral damage and, 241
  - defined, 252
  - of terrorists, 255-264
- TBIJ (The Bureau of Investigative Journalism), 266-267
- Teichman, Jenny, 55
- terrorism, 159
  - as-crime, 248-249, 251
  - defined, 248-254
  - international, 7, 79
  - as-war, 248-250
- Thailand 2014 riots, 121
- "theater of war," 272-273
- Thomson, Judith Jarvis, 5, 57-66, 71, 73, 75
  - (p.294)** transferable rights, 112
- Turner, Ian William, 130-131
- Tynan, Steven, 124
- UAVs (unmanned aerial vehicles). *See* drones
- Uniacke, Suzanne, 21n10, 57n15
- United Nations, 99, 104, 213, 238
  - resolution 1973, 238
- violated rights, 76
- violation thresholds, 23
- Waddington, P. A. J., 120n15, 120n16
- Walzer, Michael, 3, 8, 10, 169, 246, 286
- wars. *See also* JWT (just war theory)
  - civil, 9, 103
  - defined, 2, 162-164
  - insurrections, 102-103
  - just versus unjust, 10, 168-170, 176-177
  - of liberation, 9
  - moral justification for waging, 11

- nonconventional, 9
- synchronic and diachronic features of, 165–167
- Watson, Ray, 115–116, 124
- Yadlin, Amos, 186–190
- Yap, Joshua, 124
- Yemen, 1, 13, 265

Access brought to you by: